

**CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE (CAC)
PENINSULA CORRIDOR JOINT POWERS BOARD (JPB)
SAN MATEO COUNTY TRANSIT DISTRICT ADMINISTRATIVE BUILDING
Bacciocco Auditorium, 2nd Floor
1250 San Carlos Avenue, San Carlos CA 94070**

MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 18, 2020

MEMBERS PRESENT: A. Brandt (Vice Chair), A. Dagum, P. Flautt, R. Kutler, P. Leung, N. Mathur (Alternate), K. Maxwell (Alternate), D. Tuzman, B. Shaw (Chair)

MEMBERS ABSENT: L. Klein, M. Romo

STAFF PRESENT: M. Jones, J. Navarrete, J. Navarro, J. Sharma, S. Petty

Due to COVID-19, this meeting was conducted as a teleconference pursuant to the provisions of the Governor's Executive Orders N-25-20 and N-29-20, which suspends certain requirements of the Ralph M. Brown Act.

Chair Brian Shaw called the meeting to order at 5:41 p.m. and led the Pledge of Allegiance.

D. Tuzman joined at 5:43

APPOINTMENT OF NOMINATING COMMITTEE

A nominating committee was established with three CAC members, P. Flautt, R. Kutler, and A. Brandt, one from each county. Staff will coordinate a conference call, in early December, for the committee to meet and provide a recommendation for Chair and Vice Chair.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF OCTOBER 21, 2020

Motion/Second: Leung / Brandt

Ayes: Dagum, Flautt, Kutler, Tuzman, Shaw

Absent: Klein, Romo

PUBLIC COMMENT

Roland Lebrun, San Jose, via Zoom Q&A, stated that Program Management Oversight Committee reports, PMOC are reports written by a set of consultants hired by the Federal Transportation Administration, FTA, who is providing hundreds of millions of dollars for the Electrification Project. He stated that Samtrans will receive multiple citations from him in the next week or so because of refusal to release documents from May and September. He stated that he has issued an FOIA, a Freedom of Information Act, equivalent to Public Records Act, but on the federal level. He stated that back in May, they knew that the Electrification would be delayed until 2024. Additionally, he

stated that he will be presenting the technical details of the Dual Speed check, Dual consistent Wait Time at the LPMG, Local Program Maker Group and why it will not work. He said that he will have to come up with a counterproposal.

CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT

Chair Brian Shaw congratulated Caltrain, the region and the three counties that voted to pass Measure RR. He stated that it will put Caltrain on stable footing, particularly under these challenging conditions, dealing with the pandemic and the drop in ridership as a result of that. He stated that he and Vice Chair Adrian Brandt asked for a review and an understanding of how we measure will affect Caltrain and has been scheduled for January's CAC meeting. He then stated that there needed to be other changes to the Work Plan that has been provided in the Agenda Packet. Chair Shaw stated that both him and Vice Chair Brandt review these changes with staff each month and staff is very good at explaining and providing transparency on any changes to the Work Plan.

Public Comment:

Roland Lebrun, San Jose, via Zoom Q&A, stated that there is a debate whether Measure RR passed in Santa Clara, however it does not matter as it passed. He stated that half of Santa Clara County does not get Caltrain service. He then stated that people from all three counties are concerned about governance. He stated that he has pointed them to the Board Resolution that placed the Measure on the ballot. Roland then stated that eighteen months ago he recommended to move EMU testing to TTCL in Pueblo. He said that TTCL is testing at 160 MPH and that they have no COVID cases. He stated that he has recommended, to the Board, to evacuate the trains from Salt Lake City, which is riddled with COVID and move them to Colorado.

Jeff Carter, Millbrae, via Zoom Q&A, stated that he was very pleased with the passage of Measure RR. He stated that the dedicated funding will give Caltrain a bright future and hopes to see great things to come.

COMMITTEE COMMENTS

Member Patrick Flautt commended Caltrain on Measure RR passing. He stated that a dedicated funding source is nice to have in addition to farebox. This means that Caltrain will be able to enhance services and offer new features and deliver on its promise when the electric fleet comes online. He then stated that he has had interviews with the development company and Jeremy Lipps for the website and will be involved in that process. He hopes to eventually bring feedback as they hit major milestones. He said that all CAC members should have received an email with details. Member Rosalind Kutler stated that she had not. Mr. Joe Navarro stated that he would have Jeremy Lipps resend the email to all Committee Members.

Vice Chair Adrian Brandt was pleased that Measure RR passed. He also stated that he is pleased that LPMG will receive a presentation on the Constant Warning Time. He stated that he has looked over the slides and they bury the fact that the trains that are in the low category will be treated as going at 59 miles an hour and high category will

be treated as going 79 miles an hour, which means that for all trains that are actually going slower, warning times will increase. He also stated that he was surprised to see in that presentation, that staff is planning a wireless improvement which will simulate and approximate constant warning time in the future. He stated that the PMOC report that public commenter, Roland LeBron referenced, points out a major problem with the electrification project and the delay. He stated that the delay is related to the implementation of this Constant Warning Time Solution. He stated that Balfour is now putting the substantial completion in 2024. Lastly, Vice Chair Brandt referred to the correspondence packet and found an account of an incident where a rider alleges that a conductor wrestled him to the ground and choked him. He stated that he is hoping that it is not true, however if it is, there will be the appropriate review and counseling or disciplinary action.

Member Rosalind Kutler said that she was thrilled about the passage of Measure RR. She also thanked staff who did the analysis for the upcoming schedule because she can see that they were very thoughtful about who is riding now. She then stated that she also read the correspondence package and realized that is a personnel matter and is not directly something staff can respond to directly, but would like to talk to the processes and the training on how conductors are trained to eject people from the train. She stated that it is something that could be fine-tuned, in concert with equity initiative, it is an opportunity to improve service.

Member David Tuzman shared that he is also happy that Measure RR passed. He stated that it passed with 69% across the region, which is a real strong message that the region wants Caltrain to continue and to improve. It is a reminder to local electives that the region does want Caltrain despite perceived noise or passing tracks to be added that may encroach a little closer near someone's backyard. Caltrain is worth it and is an important service.

Alternate Member Kathleen Maxwell expressed her delight with the passage of Measure RR. She then addressed the eight-page complaint in the correspondence packet. She asked whether Caltrain is the only Transit Agency that does not allow passengers to purchase tickets on the train. Chair Shaw responded that Proof of Payment is not uncommon and that Mr. Navarro, Deputy Chief, Rail Operations worked hard to change the process of enforcement from being a criminal offense to more like a parking citation. Chair Shaw stated that he also read the complaint in the correspondence packet and was puzzled as to why the conductor did not just issue the citation. Chair Shaw acknowledged that staff must be looking at the complaint to resolve. Member Kutler added that the rider in the complaint stated that there was an equity issue. She said that the train should be a safe place for everyone to ride.

Public Comments:

Roland Lebrun, San Jose, via Zoom Q&A, stated that he is proposing two class action lawsuits, one for Measure A and the other for Measure B. He said that VTA is saying that they will no longer be obligated to contribute to Caltrain after Measure RR passes. Roland stated that it is a false statement due to specific ballot language. He then stated that he caught them stashing away \$110M worth of CARES ACT funding and

reported it to MTC on Monday morning and by Tuesday they announced increased service. He then stated that regarding the PMOC report, it was May's that was not published which shows a \$234M change older for Constant Wait Time. Lastly, he stated that in the UK conductors do not accept cash and if a passenger does not pay their fare, there will be staff waiting at their destination.

Jeff Carter, Millbrae, via Zoom Q&A, stated that the Palo Alto Daily Post had written a lot of inaccuracies in their editorials. He then stated that regarding the customer complaint in the correspondence packet, he hopes that disciplinary action will be taken by TASI once reviewed. Lastly, regarding Proof of Payment, he stated that it is not as common in the USA. He also stated that staff has changed the proof of payment system for the better and is more friendly to the rider.

HILLSDALE / 25TH AVENUE GRADE SEPERATION

Joy Sharma, Senior Project Manager presented the 25th Avenue Grade Separation Update.

The full Power Point presentation can be found on caltrain.com

Committee Comments:

Vice Chair Brandt asked what was the reason for the complete closure of Hillsdale station? Ms. Sharma stated that it was recommended by City of San Mateo to do the full closure with minimum number of days impacting the community. Vice Chair Brandt then said that with the Caltrain 2040 Business Plan, staff envisions High Speed Rail coming, and asked where additional tracks would be added. Ms. Sharma responded that it is her understanding that as design is for the East Side and the project made sure that there were no obstructions to preclude future tracks that might be coming up. Mr. Navarro stated that he would get back to the committee when and if additional tracks will be added.

Public Comments:

Roland Lebrun, San Jose, via Zoom Q&A, stated that his comments are not personal to Ms. Sharma or Mr. Navarro. Roland stated that this project has nothing to do with grade separating 25th Avenue and that it was to connect Bay Meadows to the Hillsdale Shopping Center, including creating two new crossings that did not exist before at 28th and 31st Avenue and that the entire project cost \$200M. Roland stated that although there it looks like there is room for passing, it is impossible unless you start crossing tracks going in opposite direction. He stated that he has been advocating to get rid of Samtrans because they do not get it. Roland said that the path forward is to unfortunately it will cost us a minimum of \$20 million to demolish the entire station because the tracks need to go where the island platform is.

CLIPPER START QUARTERLY UPDATE

Melissa Jones, Principal Planner presented the Clipper START Quarterly Update.

The full Power Point presentation can be found on caltrain.com

Committee Comments:

Member Kutler asked for organizations that have not been contacted yet, how do they get materials. Ms. Jones responded that MTC is distributing all the materials. Mr. Navarro said that he would share Ms. Jones' information with Member Kutler for additional details.

Vice Chair Brandt indicated that this program is great news if indeed it is attracting 66% more rides than otherwise people would have taken because they could not afford the fare. He noted that the numbers right now, are miniscule, but is encouraged by the fact that it will continues to grow.

Member Flautt agreed with Vice Chair Brandt that it is a win/win for Caltrain. He then asked what the success metrics for this pilot program are. Ms. Jones responded that none have been set and will report back once they have been established.

Member Tuzman asked whether the application has a question about whether the applicants are existing riders or new riders. Ms. Jones confirmed that there is. Member Tuzman then shared that it is a great idea that staff is reaching out to those applicants with incomplete applications and suggested to capture common friction points. Lastly, Mr. Tuzman noticed that there is a requirement for a Bay Area mailing address and shared that applicants may be currently homeless and asked whether staff has information about getting a temporary mailing address for them. Ms. Jones responded that she would check with MTC for an answer.

Alternate Member Maxwell stated that there was some discussion about the elite nature of Caltrain and so to have a program that addresses and targets this demographic is huge and a big deal and supports anything staff can do to promote it.

Member Kutler suggested to draw from the survey questions in thinking about metrics. She then stated that libraries no longer require an address to have a library card and that it is an equity point. She said that as homelessness rises people deserve services, regardless of whether they have an address and that it would be an increasing need.

Public Comments:

Jeff Carter, Millbrae, via Zoom Q&A, was pleased to see that the program is working and that more people are starting to use Clippers Start. He hopes that in the future it could include the Eligible Discount for the Monthly Pass to encourage ridership. He also appreciates that Caltrain went from the 20% discount down to the 50% discount. He stated that some of the slide sources are MTC 2020 Cubic Crystal Reports and asked how the public can view that information. Lastly, he said that grade separations are

road improvements and the funding should come from road funds, not entirely from transit funds. Lastly, he appreciated Vice Chair Brandt's comments regarding expanding the tracks to four tracks, because in order for a Local and Express combination service, there will need to be passing tracks through a number of stations, so that you can run decent Local service and good Express service at the same time.

TRAIN SCHEDULE / CALTRAIN BUSINESS PLAN - COVID RECOVERY PLANNING - UPDATE ON NEAR TERM SERVICE PLANNING

Sebastian Petty, Deputy Chief, Caltrain Planning presented the Caltrain Business Plan - COVID Recovery Planning – Update on Near Term Service Planning

The full Power Point presentation can be found on caltrain.com

Committee Comments:

Vice Chair Brandt asked, with the recommended service plan what connections between certain station pairs will not be possible. Mr. Petty referred to his presentation and stated that they may change. Vice Chair Brandt that he is comforted by the statistics saying that it is only 3% of actual real-world travel demands that would be impacted. Mr. Petty clarified that it is based on pre-COVID data.

Member Kutler appreciates consistent service as it will be helpful to essential workers who are mostly riding the train and most essential workers do not have a choice about where they need to be when they need to be there.

Chair Shaw agreed with Member Kutler's comment. He stated that this reflects what is happening now, the service is being used by essential people. He said that realigning the schedule to reflect their needs, to know that the train will come every 30 minutes, is a tremendous benefit to that population. He applauded Caltrain for recognizing the need to make this change and recognizing that at some point, it may need to be adjusted. Until COVID is no longer a problem, Caltrain needs to move the essential people to work in an easy and efficient way.

Public Comments:

Roland Lebrun, San Jose, via Zoom Q&A, stated that Capital Corridor is down to 15% ridership, not 5%. He stated that the reason they have recovered is that they are providing the same service as they always have. The time it takes to go from point A to point B is the same. He said that it has not happened with Caltrain. He stated that in his case, it is a one-hour difference each way and that he would not consider wasting his time with Caltrain. He stated that the issue with planning is that staff is focusing on the disadvantaged and low-income communities, 5% of ridership and we are completely ignoring the other 95%.

Jeff Carter, Millbrae, via Zoom Q&A, mentioned that the links to the presentation on the website do not match the ones that were presented. Additionally, they are formatted to print on legal size paper and cuts off part of the slide presentation when printing.

Jeff appreciates that the schedule is moving to more frequently during the midday. He then stated that extending the service pattern later would be helpful to the essential workers. He also said that he is glad that the weekends are going back, however he wonders whether it will affect the electrification schedule. Lastly regarding the station pairs, he said that when you look back at the ridership, the ridership reflects the schedule pre-COVID schedule so stations that got poor service naturally would get poor ridership and the stations that get good service, get better ridership so it is like the demand is matching the service, not the service matching the demand.

Drew, via Zoom Q&A, asked whether the schedule will have minor changes with the upcoming Hillsdale station reopening and the Atherton station closure. Mr. Petty responded that there will be minor adjustments with these events.

STAFF REPORT UPDATE

Joe Navarro, Deputy Chief, Rail Operations, reported:
(The full report can be found on caltrain.com)

On-time Performance (OTP) –

- **October:** The October 2020 OTP was 97.4% compared to 93.3% for October 2019.
 - **Vehicle on Tracks** – There was one day, October 25, with a vehicle on the tracks that caused train delays.
 - **Mechanical Delays** – In October 2020 there were 358 minutes of delay due to mechanical issues compared to 792 minutes in October 2019.
- **September:** The September 2020 OTP was 97.5% compared to 93% for September 2019.

(The full report can be found on caltrain.com)

Mr. Navarro addressed the earlier comments regarding the customer complaint. He stated that there is an ongoing investigation with the conductor regarding the alleged assault. Mr. Navarro said that staff responds to every assault. In this case, the TASI General Manager and the Sheriff's Department responded to San Francisco immediately after the incident occurred and interviewed the crew. Mr. Navarro stated that he could not go into further detail as the incident is still under investigation. Mr. Navarro then reported that the EMU HVAC system has the MERV8 filter and will be testing in Salt Lake City for a higher grade of filter. He indicated that staff also has the ability to reprogram the intake of fresh air on the computer system, so that if staff wanted to draw 100% fresh air on the system, they could. He stated that there is no further development needed with the EMU system.

Committee Comments:

Vice Chair Brandt asked Mr. Navarro for a brief status update on the plexiglass shields. Mr. Navarro responded that it is out in operation to get a feel for the resilience of the material. He stated that staff is monitoring feedback and whether there will need to be alterations. He also stated that staff will meet with the manufacturer for a potential timeline for producing the required sets.

Public comments:

Roland Lebrun, San Jose, via Zoom Q&A, stated that Amsted is basically doing the same thing as what the airlines are doing. They are modifying the airflow inside the train so that instead of the airflow traveling horizontally, it basically starts at the top and go straight down before it goes back to the circulation system, it goes through the filters and he would like to know if that is what Stadler is doing.

JPB CAC Work Plan

December 16, 2020

- Government Affairs update / 2021 Draft Legislative Program
- San Francisco Downtown Extension update

January 20, 2021

- Sales Tax Measure
- Transit Oriented Development
- PCEP Update
- TASI Operating Budget

February 17, 2021

- Grade Crossing Improvements
- Industry Safe Functionality

March 17, 2021

-
-

April 21, 2021

- EMU Testing Update
-

Suggested Items:

- Go Pass cost per ride factors – requested by Chair, Brian Shaw on 6/19/19
- San Mateo County Climate Action Plan – requested by Member Rosalind Kutler on 10/16/19
- MTC Means-Based Discount Fare program update

- Caltrain connections with other agencies – requested by Member Rosalind Kutler on 12/18/19
- Update on grade crossing pilot six months after installation – requested by Member, Patrick Flautt on 12/18/19
- Summary video of the CAC meetings by the Social Media Officer – requested by Chair, Brian Shaw on 12/18/19
- Operating Costs – requested by Member Adrian Brandt on 2/13/20
- Rail Corridor Use Policy – requested by Member Anna Dagum on 10/21/20
- South San Francisco

DATE, TIME AND LOCATION OF NEXT REGULAR MEETING:

December 16, 2020 at 5:40 p.m., San Mateo County Transit District Administrative Building, 2nd Floor Bacciocco Auditorium, 1250 San Carlos Avenue, San Carlos, CA.

Adjourned at 8:12 pm