

**CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE (CAC)
PENINSULA CORRIDOR JOINT POWERS BOARD (JPB)
SAN MATEO COUNTY TRANSIT DISTRICT ADMINISTRATIVE BUILDING
Bacciocco Auditorium, 2nd Floor
1250 San Carlos Avenue, San Carlos CA 94070**

MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 16, 2022

MEMBERS PRESENT: A. Brandt, R. Jaques (Alternate), L. Klein, R. Kutler, P. Leung, M. Pagee (Alternate), B. Shaw (Chair), JP. Torres, D. Tuzman (Vice Chair), S. Seebart, E. Shapiro

MEMBERS ABSENT: P. Joshi (Alternate)

STAFF PRESENT: T. Burgwyn, J. Harrison, A. Myles-Primakoff, J. Navarrete, D. Santoro, B. Thompson

Due to COVID-19, this meeting was conducted as a teleconference pursuant to the provisions of the Governor's Executive Orders N-25-20 and N-29-20, which suspends certain requirements of the Ralph M. Brown Act.

Chair Brian Shaw called the meeting to order at 5:41 p.m. and led the Pledge of Allegiance.

APPOINTMENT OF NOMINATING COMMITTEE

A nominating committee was established with three CAC members, A. Brandt, S. Seebart, and R. Kutler, one member from each county. Staff will coordinate a conference call for the nominating committee to meet and provide a recommendation for Chair and Vice Chair for 2023.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF OCTOBER 19, 2022

Motion/Second: Klein / Brandt

Ayes: Kutler, Leung, Seebart, Shapiro, Shaw, Torres, Tuzman

Abstain: none

Absent: none

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT

Chair Brian Shaw reported that Caltrain meetings may be moving back to in person, subject to the Brown Act remote requirements, starting in March 2023 and that it would be further explained during agenda item 8, Brown Act Training. He then reported that December, January, and February's Citizen's Advisory Committee meetings will likely be hybrid just as the Board has been meeting since May. He then stated that the change is pending the likely lifting of the

emergency order in February 2023 or if there are any amendments to the Brown Act. Chair Shaw then mentioned that at December's hybrid meeting, staff will provide a holiday meal and encouraged both members from the committee and the public to attend.

COMMITTEE COMMENTS

Member Adrian Brandt asked when will committee members, attending the CAC meeting remotely, need to open their doors to persons from the public. Chair Shaw stated that if the committee members continue to attend remotely in December, January, and February, it would not be necessary. He also stated that the option to attend in person starts in December, in preparation for the potential in person meeting in March.

Vice Chair David Tuzman shared his experience on Caltrain from Saturday. He stated that there was lack of communication and messaging during delays. It was later determined that this incident took place on Friday and that Mr. David Santoro, Acting Chief Operating Officer, would look into this matter.

Member Rosalind Kutler suggested Vice Chair Tuzman to call customer service next time he experiences delays. She then addressed the correspondence in the CAC packet from the downtown café and asked staff to follow-up. Lastly, she mentioned that she would be attending an SFMTA meeting on November 30th.

Member Brandt pointed out that one of the lowest customer satisfaction survey results was in notification about delays. He also shared other experiences with passengers standing on the wrong platform and missing their train. He then shared his concerns with the upcoming increase in construction, schedule cutbacks and the lack of customer communication. Member Brandt mentioned his support of a policy that includes pets onboard the trains. Lastly, he shared his concerns and his suggestions to prevent vehicles on the tracks.

Public Comments:

Jeff Carter, Millbrae, via Zoom Q&A, shared the importance of customer communication during delays. He also suggested Caltrain customer service be available during all revenue hours. He also shared his disappointment with the scheduled cutbacks and changes to accommodate electrification. Lastly, he requested staff to review Member Brandt's idea to prevent vehicles on the tracks.

BROWN ACT TRAINING AND PRESENTATION

James Harrison and Anna Myles-Primakoff, Olson Remcho, LLP, presented the Brown Act Training. The full presentation can be found on caltrain.com.

Committee Comments:

Member Brandt asked how a CAC member would obtain approval for a qualifying exemption. Mr. Harrison explained that the approval requirement only applies to emergency circumstances and the CAC member would make the request and the CAC would consider that as its first item of business. Otherwise, if a CAC member would like to participate remotely, they will need to

provide the address of the location from where they are participating to be posted on the agenda so that persons of the public may join and observe the meeting from that location.

Member Kutler asked for clarification regarding committee comments and items not on the agenda. Mr. Harrison explained that committee comments do not need to be agendaized. He also stated that it is prohibited for committee members to engage in communications among majority of the members of the CAC regarding matters within the CAC's jurisdiction outside of a noticed CAC meeting. Member Kutler also acknowledged that the alternate CAC members give the CAC flexibility.

Member Larry Klein asked about the agenda logistics when an emergency circumstance occurs. Mr. Harrison responded that if there is enough time, staff will revise and repost the agenda to indicate that the CAC would be considering an emergency circumstances request. Member Klein then asked about the timeline and when there is not enough time to update the agenda. Mr. Harrison advised that the CAC would have the authority to address an emergency circumstance without it being agendaized.

Member Brandt asked about Brown Act violation regarding social media and Mr. Harrison responded that CAC members should refrain from commenting, reposting, or liking a post from another member as it pertains to an item within the CAC's jurisdiction.

Vice Chair Tuzman asked about pre-covid CAC attendance. Chair Shaw responded that alternate CAC members give the CAC a buffer when not all CAC member positions are filled and helps during the process of filling those seats.

Member Jean-Paul Torres asked how many CAC members make up a majority. Mr. Harrison responded that it would be five members of the CAC.

Member Steve Seebart asked whether a quorum would need to include a representation from all three counties, and Chair Shaw stated that it would not.

Public Comments:

Jeff Carter, Millbrae, via Zoom Q&A, expressed his disappointment that the committee members will need to provide their physical location after February. He stated that the remote meetings are working well. He then asked whether members of the public may interact with CAC members on social media. Chair Shaw replied that CAC members may interact with the public so long no other CAC members are present.

Adina Levin, via Zoom Q&A, shared that MTC is looking at the Brown Act reform, to address the issues that members of the CAC have raised about needing to post and publish the remote location. She then stated that the committee may be interested in whether Caltrain is also working to support improving and modernizing that legislation. Chair Shaw stated that he has not seen a report from Government Affairs indicating so.

PCEP CONSTRUCTION SCHEDULE CHANGE / CONSTRUCTION SCHEDULE CHANGE

Ted Burgwyn, Director, Rail Network and Operations Planning and Brent Tietjen, Government and Community Affairs Officer, presented the PCEP Construction Schedule Change presentation. The full presentation can be found on caltrain.com.

Committee Comments:

Member Brandt suggested having sawhorses with very eye-catching signs at all station entrance areas directing passengers to bus stops. He then asked staff to confirm whether there will be more bus bridges to keep the electrification schedule from slipping. Mr. Burgwyn stated that this is the second phase of the signal cut over work and that there are future phases of signal cut over work that will require some service changes next year, and that staff is in preliminary discussions to develop a plan for future work.

Member Seebart was pleased to hear that there will be ambassadors to help direct passengers and asked whether they will be available for the duration of revenue service. Mr. Burgwyn stated that those details are still being worked out, however staff has put together a signage plan and an ambassador plan, however, depends on staff availability. He also informed the committee that staff has contracted a firm that may be able to staff ambassadors and that those details are still being worked out.

Member Klein was glad to hear about the ambassador plan. He then asked what the plan is for Clipper tag on and off at the temporary stops. Mr. Burgwyn stated that passengers will tag on/off at the Caltrain station then tag on/off once the passenger reaches their destination. He also stated that staff is making the bus stops as close to the stations as possible. Member Klein stated that it impedes passengers even more by having to walk back to the station after their trip has ended to tag off and recommended temporary Clipper readers at these locations.

Vice Chair Tuzman requested that at multilevel stations, staff place the signage at ground level and to post the information at other transit agencies that connect with Caltrain to better inform passengers.

Member Brandt agreed with Member Klein's comments and requested that no passengers be cited during this period and that there be enough buses to accommodate passenger with bicycles.

Public Comments:

Jeff Carter, Millbrae, via Zoom Q&A, requested that the signage be visible. He also mentioned that ambassadors to help direct passengers during this time is a great idea. Jeff suggested having a bus that runs after 9 p.m. after service shuts down. Lastly, he suggested a better plan to tag on and off, or citation leniency during this period.

Chair Shaw recommended a more seamless operation for tagging on and off to lessen the inconvenience for the passenger.

CLIPPER NEXT GENERATION OVERVIEW & MONTHLY PASS RECOMMENDATION

Bruce Thompson, Manager, Fare Program Operations, presented the Clipper Next Generation Overview & Monthly Pass Recommendation presentation. The full presentation can be found on caltrain.com.

Committee Comments:

Vice Chair Tuzman asked whether the cost of the monthly pass will increase with Clipper 2. Mr. Thompson stated that there is no planned increase for the functionality.

Member Brandt suggested fare enforcement staff to be aware of the loopholes and asked what happens when a passenger tags on and off at the same station. He then stated that the current tariff, is completely unchanged with this proposal and does nothing to improve the inequity and encouraged staff to look at implementing the distance-based fares. He then asked for clarification around the mobile ticketing. Regarding mobile ticketing, Mr. Thompson responded that when multiple tickets are purchased on the Caltrain app it causes problems with fare enforcement and to prevent that, individual tickets will not be sold on the app and instead passenger will be able to tap on and off. He then informed the committee that when a passenger taps on and immediately taps off, the system will not register that tap and will need to wait sixty to ninety seconds to re-tap.

Member Patricia Leung appreciates the installation of the new Clipper devices to help alleviate the lines. She then recognized that the new requirement to tag on and off will help gather data to determine whether station-based fare and integrated fares are feasible. Mr. Thompson responded that it would provide Caltrain with more data.

Member Kutler asked whether there will be customer education with the new system. Mr. Thompson responded that there would need to be customer education with Clipper Next generation, overall.

Vice Chair Tuzman requested that the new system allow more flexibility to feed into other apps. Mr. Thompson advised that the business rules are still being reviewed and that he would return to this committee with more information as it becomes available.

Public Comments:

Adina Levin, via Zoom Q&A, stated that the Regional Fare Coordination and Integration Study shows significant benefits to ridership with Caltrain's standardized fare structure and hopes that Caltrain can move in that direction. She also stated that moving toward an accumulator model, which Clipper 2 may support, would be helpful.

Jeff Carter, Millbrae, via Zoom Q&A, recommended that Caltrain move to a station-to-station fare structure. He then stated that he likes the idea of automatic zone upgrades and that it would work with station-to-station fare structure. He then asked how the zone upgrades would work mid-trip and Mr. Thompson explained.

Chair Shaw stated that this is heading in the right direction and that the goal is to remove the zone-based fares and to move to a fare structure like BART and move to a station-to-station fare structure.

STAFF REPORT UPDATE

David Santoro, Acting Chief Operating Officer reported (The full report can be found on caltrain.com):

On-time Performance (OTP) –

- **October:** The October 2022 OTP was 90.8% compared to 93.8% for October 2021.
 - **Vehicle on Tracks** – There were three days, October 13, 27 and 28 with a vehicle on the tracks, which caused train delays
 - **Mechanical Delays** – In October 2022 there were 816 minutes of delay due to mechanical issues compared to 980 minutes in October 2021.
 - **Trespasser Strike** – There was one trespasser strike on October 14 in San Francisco, resulting in a non-fatality, which caused 1 train annulled and 21 trains delayed.
- **September:** The September 2022 OTP was 85.5% compared to 95.6% for September 2021.
 - **Vehicle Strike** – There was one vehicle strike on September 8 at Churchill Avenue, which caused 2 trains delayed. **This strike occurred on September 9, but we were still operating September 8 revenue service. **
 - **Trespasser Strikes** – There were two trespasser strikes on September 2 and 6, resulting in one fatality. The strike on the 2nd was a non-fatality at San Antonio Station, which caused 1 train terminated, 1 train annulled, and 12 trains delayed. The strike on the 6th was a fatality on the UPRR territory, which caused 1 train terminated and 2 trains delayed.

Mr. Santoro invited the committee to review the agenda packet for Holiday Service modified schedules. He also mentioned that Caltrain will offer free fares starting at 8 p.m. on New Year's Eve. He then shared that the Holiday Train is scheduled for December 3rd and 4th.

Committee Comments:

Vice Chair Tuzman requested staff to investigate the incident he had described earlier in the meeting and corrected the date of the incident as Friday night, Saturday morning. Mr. Santoro responded that staff would look into the matter and would follow-up through the CAC Secretary.

Member Brandt stated the Average Weekday Ridership has dropped by one percent and is heading in the wrong direction. He also requested that staff provide the percentage on the report. He then requested staff to provide a presentation considering ways to prevent vehicles on the tracks. Mr. Santoro stated that he would work with the Safety group to put together a presentation for the committee.

Public Comments:

None

JPB CAC Work Plan

December 21, 2022

- Suicide Prevention Initiatives
- PCEP Construction Schedule Changes
-

January 18, 2023

- CAC role in Measure RR oversight update
-
-

February 15, 2023

- Measure RR audit report
-
-

March 15, 2023

-
-
-

April 19, 2023

-
-
-

May 21, 2022

-
-

Suggested Items:

- Go Pass cost per ride factors – requested by Chair, Brian Shaw on 6/19/19
- San Mateo County Climate Action Plan – requested by Member Rosalind Kutler on 10/16/19
- MTC Means-Based Discount Fare program update
- Caltrain connections with other agencies – requested by Member Rosalind Kutler on 12/18/19 and Alternate Member Rob Jaques on 12/15/21
- Update on grade crossing pilot six months after installation – requested by Member, Patrick Flautt on 12/18/19
- Operating Costs – requested by Member Adrian Brandt on 2/13/20
- Rail Corridor Use Policy – requested by Member Anna Dagum on 10/21/20
- Industry Safe Functionality
- Blue Ribbon Task Force
- Clipper Data Availability
- Construction Obstacles
- Wireless Solution Technology – requested by Member Adrian Brandt on 12/8/21
- Redwood City Station Development - requested by Member Adrian Brandt on 12/8/21
- Dual speed check installation/Constant Warning, Downtown Extension, elevated four track station, future Dumbarton Rail extension and the Google campus being planned at the Diridon station, PCEP project wireless overlay system and level boarding and the status of fully vaccinated staff - requested by Member Adrian Brandt on 12/15/21
- Transit Oriented Development & historic station preservation outreach - requested by Member Patricia Leung on 12/15/21
- Equity evaluation on the most recent schedule change and Go Pass qualification requirements - requested by Member Rosalind Kutler on 12/15/21
- Staffing structure, Governance Update, Visual Messaging Display rollout plan, Equity Plan implementation/update and periodic updates from Government Affairs regarding funding sources and how infrastructure bills may impact Caltrain - requested by Member David Tuzman on 12/15/21
- Caltrain Wayfinding improved, specifically with single tracking - requested by Member Jean-Paul Torres on 12/15/21
- Conductor’s communication tools and how they may interface with the public. Regional trip planning and availability for riders that do not have access to mobile devices - requested by Alternate Member Melody Pagee on 12/15/21
- Distance-based fares on Caltrain. Deep dive on it from a practical standpoint - requested by Chair, Brian Shaw on 12/15/21
- iPhones for Conductors
- Constant Warning
- Engineering Standards

- Brainstorming sessions for Conductor iPhone applications
- Fare Enforcement Update – requested by Chair, Brian Shaw on 7/20/22
- Proof of Payment
- Clipper Next Gen Validator Project Update
- Grade Crossing Presentation – requested by Member Adrian Brandt on 9/21/22
- Look into allowing non-service animals on Caltrain with a travel carrier - requested by Vice-Chair David Tuzman on 9/21/22
- Code of Conduct

DATE, TIME, AND LOCATION OF NEXT REGULAR MEETING:

The next meeting will be December 21, 2022, at 5:40 pm, via Zoom (additional location, if any, to be determined).

Adjourned at 8:23 pm.